



The Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare

Volume 40
Issue 1 *March*

Article 16

2013

Review of *Mother-Talk: Conversations with Mothers of Lesbian Daughters and FTM Transgender Children*. Sarah E Pearlman. Reviewed by Melinda McCormick.

Melinda McCormick
Western Michigan University

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/jssw>



Part of the Social Work Commons

Recommended Citation

McCormick, Melinda (2013) "Review of *Mother-Talk: Conversations with Mothers of Lesbian Daughters and FTM Transgender Children*. Sarah E Pearlman. Reviewed by Melinda McCormick.," *The Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare*: Vol. 40 : Iss. 1 , Article 16.

Available at: <https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/jssw/vol40/iss1/16>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Social Work at ScholarWorks at WMU. For more information, please contact maira.bundza@wmich.edu.



Nussbaum's emphasis on critical self-examination. From my perspective, the book has some problems. I do not think Nussbaum has made the case for her title, *The New Religious Intolerance*. Indeed, intolerance seems neither new nor exclusively religious. Her focus on Muslims might be a "fresh" intolerance, but then the Crusades come to mind. I felt that an explanation of why fear was a cause of intolerance was unclear. The chapters are so rich with detailed examples that one gets lost and loses the main point of the volume. Nussbaum's "longtime" Harvard University Press editor, Joyce Seltzer, could have helped her out here, but a deep relationship with a prestigious high-powered thinker may have gotten in the way of that. And while I did not mind the author's ranging over philosophers from Socrates on, I think that might be a little distracting for the general reader. My guess is that Nussbaum had one eye on her philosophical colleagues.

Nussbaum's argument of American "exceptionalism" in the religious tolerance field may have some merit, but when held against slavery, our treatment of Native Americans, and our current "rage" against immigrants, it is hard for me to get on this bus with her. Finally, though I like the solution of self examination, it has not had a history of working all that well over the centuries in preventing intolerance, so I would hope we could also have a Plan B and C, at the very least.

John Tropman, School of Social Work, University of Michigan

Sarah F. Pearlman, *Mother-Talk: Conversations with Mothers of Lesbian Daughters and FTM Transgender Children*. Demeter Press, (2012). \$24.95 (paperback).

Social science literature has shown that parents of LGBT persons have their own emotional journeys to navigate when their children come out as gay, lesbian, bisexual, or transgender. Many themes have been identified in the literature surrounding this process for parents, usually around issues of loss of hopes and dreams that parents have held for their children, as well as fears for their children's continued safety in a world that tends to be hostile to sexual minorities. Support for parents in this process has been shown to be especially important in coming to a place of acceptance of their children, and

being able to speak with other parents in situations such as Parents, Families and Friends of Lesbians and Gays (PFLAG) groups can be very helpful in easing the isolation felt by parents during this process.

In *Mother-Talk*, Sarah F. Pearlman has gathered narratives of mothers to give voice to the process of dealing with daughters coming out as lesbian or female-to-male transgender. These brave mothers have shared openly with Pearlman their own struggles and difficulties of dealing not only with their daughters and those relationships, but also with their friends and family members. In some cases, the mothers have been able to move to acceptance and have fulfilling long-term relationships with their daughters, while in others, cultural and familial pressures have proven to be serious barriers. An important point to note, however, is that the mothers in these stories wanted to stay connected to their children; the voices of those mothers who terminated relations with their daughters aren't represented here.

Pearlman is clear that this book isn't for academics, and that is evident in the brief treatment given to research methods in the appendix. As an academic reader, I wanted to have more grounding for her work, understand her choices, and hear more about the themes she pulled out of the narratives. The book is organized into sections entitled: Devastation, Loss, Not the Only Issue, Adolescence, Keeping the Connection, and Activism, which the author claims capture the major themes of the stories. However, the themes are used only as chapter titles, and no further development of the ideas or their significance is mentioned by the author, a missed opportunity to give the themes context.

What the themes do offer, however, is a glimpse into the paths the mothers have taken in terms of their daughters' journeys. In the section Devastation, mothers share their own shock and struggles to come to terms with their daughters' coming out. In Loss, the mothers share moving from devastation to feeling the loss of hopes and dreams they had for their children's lives and their parts in those dreams. In Not the Only Issue, mothers note that other problems in their daughter's lives, such as eating disorders or suicidal urges, meant that sexuality sometimes paled in importance. Adolescence addresses ways in which the mothers are able to comfort

themselves by looking back to their daughters' adolescence and finding clues they may have misinterpreted at the time. Many mothers, however, focus on how to maintain connections to their daughters after coming out, as discussed in *Keeping the Connection*. This can be especially difficult for mothers when coming out leads to a daughter becoming a son; this opens an entirely different area and depth of loss. Many mothers, finally, found that as they grow and learn about their daughters and their friends, they became activists for LGBT persons, as discussed in *Activism*.

One of the most important things about this collection is the honesty of the voices. It's good to hear mothers being real about their process around the challenges of accepting and honoring their children's lives, whether or not they are able to understand them. This book seems to be intended for mothers and daughters who need the stories to feel connection and hope about their own processes. Mothers need to know they can make it, their children can be happy, and that others have survived the journey, and this text offers them powerful examples.

*Melinda McCormick, Department of Sociology,
Western Michigan University*

Mary-Jo DelVecchio Good, Sarah S. Willen, Seth Donal Hannah, Ken Vickery, & Lawrence Taeseng Park (Eds.). *Shattering Culture: American Medicine Responds to Cultural Diversity*. New York: Russell Sage Foundation (2011). \$34.62 (paperback).

This book is timely in addressing America's renewed focus on healthcare as disparities between various population groups in needs-identified and services received are increasingly in the public consciousness. This edited book is a collection of an interdisciplinary group of contributors, including anthropologists, psychiatrists, and sociologists, and presents an insightful perspective on contemporary culture and mental health care. The book argues that culture counts in clinical practice in reducing health inequalities. Drawing from ethnographic interviews, observations and case vignettes, *Shattering Culture*